

Report concerning the activities within the project *Beyond the Norms: Religious Practice in Medieval and Early Modern Transylvania*

(Project PN-II-ID-PCE-2011-3-0359)

2016

A first objective of the year 2016 had been the dissemination of the results of research. This objective has been achieved through the attendance of international and national conferences by all the members of the team. Thus, Ovidiu Ghitta has attended the international conference *The First International "Epaminonda Lucaciu" History Symposium: Historical Stages and Moments of Romanian Greek-Catholic Church in North America* which took place in Cleveland, Ohio (USA) between 12-14 May 2016 with a paper called „The Teachings of Bishop Petru Pavel Aaron to His Clergy” and a national conference *Violență, societate și modernizare în spațiul românesc (sec. XVI-XX) Marele război, sfârșitul modernității?* organised by the Babeș-Bolyai University of Cluj-Napoca between 2-3 June 2016 with the paper „Despre lege și fărâdelege într-o epistolă a lui Petru Pavel Aaron”

Mária Lupescu-Makó has attended the international conference *Domonkos szentek és szent helyek* organised by the Institute of Religion and Theology of the Hungarian Academy of Sciences from Debrecen and the St Ladislav Dominican Plebany of Debrecen at Debrecen, Hungary on 20 May 2016, with the paper *Domonkosok a középkori Erdélyben* (Dominicans in Medieval Transylvania). Mária Lupescu-Makó has also attended the international conference *Les couvents mendiants dans l'économie du sacré en Europe centrale (v.1220-v.1550)*, organised by the University of Rennes 2, within the framework of the research programs CERHIO CNRS UMR 6258 and MARGEC of the French National Research Agency, Rennes, France on 2-3 June 2016, with a paper called ”*Pro memoria futurorum.*” *Piety and Remembrance of the Transylvanian Testators in the Late Middle Ages*. The activities anchored in the project research will be continued by Mária Lupescu-Makó who will attend a local conference *Jakó Zsigmond centenáriumi megemlékezés* (The Centennial Commemoration of Zsigmond Jakó), organised by the Transylvanian Museum Society, Cluj, Romania on 13 October 2016, with a paper called *Jakó Zsigmond, a történettudós* (The historian Zsigmond Jakó). Mária Lupescu-Makó will attend a national conference *Emlékezet és felejtés* (Memory and Forgetfulness), organised by the Bolyai Society and the Babeș-Bolyai University, Cluj, Romania on 21-22 October 2016, with a paper called „*Pro memoria perpetua.*” *Az emlékezés stratégiái a késő középkori Erdélyben* (Pro memoria perpetua.

Commemoration strategies in medieval Transylvania), again research anchored in the theme of the project. Finally, Mária Lupescu-Makó will attend an international conference *Domonkosok – Történelem és történetiség között* (Dominicans- Between History and Narrative), organised by the Institute of Religion and Theology of the Hungarian Academy of Sciences and the Hungarian Province of the Dominican Order, Székesfehérvár, Hungary on 2-3 November 2016, with a paper called „Benedek, Erdély első domonkos püspöke” (Benedict, the first Dominican bishop of Transylvania). The scholar will also attend an international conference she has helped organise *Cluj-Napoca/Kolozsvár/Klausenburg – 700*, organised by the Faculty of History of the Babeş-Bolyai University, Sapientia University, The Transylvanian Museum Society, Cluj-Napoca, Romania on 10-13 November 2016, with a paper called „Az üdvözülés útjai – Koldulórendi konfraternitások Kolozsváron” (The Way of Redemption – Mendicant Confraternities in Cluj).

Carmen Florea has attended an international conference *La missione di Giovanni da Capestrano e il processo di Europe Making nel quattrocento: lo stato dell'arte nella storia e nella storiografia nell'Europa danubiana e balcanica*, organised by the University of Macerata (Macerata -Italy, 25 November 2015), with a paper called „St. John of Capistran's Mission to Transylvania: a Historiographic Perspective”.

Ciprian Firea has attended the national conference *Locuri ale memoriei în spațiul urban* which has taken place at Bistrița between 3-4 June 2016, with a paper called „Bisericile urbane medievale din Transilvania și memoria donatorilor. Studiu asupra mărturiilor vizuale și documentare”. Ciprian Firea has also attended the national conference *Zilele Academice Clujene 2016. Simpozionul Național de Istoria Artei Medievale și Premoderne* which has taken place at Cluj Napoca on 19 May 2016, with a paper called „Breasla pictorilor din Bistrița la sfârșitul evului mediu și un statut nou descoperit”.

Maria Crăciun, the director of the project has attended the international conference *Sixteenth Century Society Conference*, which has taken place at Bruges, Belgium between 18-20 August 2016, with a paper called „From Sacred to Ritual Space: The Transformation of the Chancel in Transylvanian Lutheran Churches of the Early Modern Period”. Maria Crăciun has also attended the international conference *Reformation Studies Colloquium 2016*, which has taken place at the University of Newcastle, Great Britain between 14-16 September 2016, with a paper called „Lutheran Retables and Confessional Iconographic Programmes in Early Modern Transylvania”.

This objective has been equally achieved through the publication in specialised journals and prestigious volumes of studies and articles by all members of the team. Thus,

Ovidiu Ghitta has published an article called „Egy szabálytalan összeírás Simon tományi görögkatolikus lelkész összeírása 1773-ból” in *Történelmi Szemle*, 1/ 2016: 127-148 (ISSN: 0040-9634).

Maria Crăciun has published ‘Unitarian Parish Churches in Early Modern Transylvania’ in Andrew Spicer (ed.), *Parish Churches in Early Modern Europe* (Farnham: Ashgate, 2015), pp. 199-242; ISBN 978-1-4724-4608-4, ‘Transylvanian Lutheran Liturgical Practices in Comparative European Perspective’ in Irene Dingel, Ute Lotz-Heumann (eds), *Entfaltung und zeitgenössische Wirkung der Reformation im europäischen Kontext / Dissemination and Contemporary Impact of the Reformation in a European Context* (Gütersloh: Gütersloher Verlagshaus, 2015), pp. 345-375; ISBN 978-3-579-05995-2 and ‘Visual Cultures’ in Howard Louthan, Graeme Murdock (eds), *A Companion to the Reformation in Central Europe* (Leiden/Boston: Brill, 2015), pp. 412-450 (in cooperation with Grazina Jurkowlaniec); ISBN 978-90-04-25527-2

Probably the most substantial result of the project are the monographs and the collective volumes published by the members of the research team. Thus, Maria Crăciun has published *Reformarea imaginii: artă, pietate și identitate în Transilvania epocii moderne timpurii (secolele XVI-XVII)*, vol. I and II (Cluj Napoca: Editura Mega, 2016), 306 pagini + index and illustrations ISBN 978-606-543-719-7, while Ciprian Firea has produced *Polipticele medievale din Transilvania: artă, liturghie, patronaj* (Cluj Napoca: Editura Mega, 2016) ISBN 978-606-543-740-1. Mária Lupescu-Makó has edited together with Veronka Dáné and Gábor Sipos a volume entitled *Testimonio Litterarum. Tanulmányok Jakó Zsigmond tiszteletére* (Kolozsvár, Erdélyi Múzeum-Egyesület, 2016), ISBN: 978-606-739-054-4. The scholar has also published an article in this volume called “Domonkos könyv kultúra Erdélyben” (pp. 233–250).

The international dissemination of the results of the project is ensured by the articles submitted and/or accepted for publication by various members of the research team. For example, Mária Lupescu-Makó has submitted an article called “Domonkosok a középkori Erdélyben” which will be published in a volume coordinated by Havas Gyöngyi, *Domonkos szentek és szent helyek* which will be published by the Debrecen University Press. Mária Lupescu-Makó has also submitted an article “Pro memoria futurorum. Piety and Remembrance of the Transylvanian Testators in the Late Middle Ages” which will be published in the volume edited by Marie-Madeleine de Cevins and Ludovic Viallet, which will be published by the Rennes University Press. Both volumes are forthcoming in 2016.

In 2016, according to the initial plan, the team of the project wished to organise an international conference to mark the end of the project, disseminate research results and highlight achievements. This idea was born in the context of the workshop held on November 1st 2012, when the presence of scholars such as Natalie Zemon Davis, William Christian and Gábor Klaniczay has triggered the initiative to invite personalities of similar status to a conference meant to mark the end of the project. When attending various conferences in 2013 and 2014 this idea was discussed with Elizabeth Tingle, Mary Lavin and Nancy Caciola who have accepted in principle to attend an event held at Cluj. However, because the first installment of the financing was only announced on 25 February 2016 and because activities for the year 2016 were meant to finish by the first decade of September it was no longer possible to invite prestigious personalities from the academic world to the planned conference. Consequently, we have abandoned the idea of organising an international conference while attempting to compensate for this drawback through more intense attendance at international conferences and by discussing the results of the research project *Beyond the norms: religious practice in late medieval and early modern Transylvania* with colleagues with similar interests. For example, both Carmen Florea and Mária Lupescu-Makó have consolidated their professional network during the meetings of the MARGEC project. For Maria Crăciun, attendance in 2016 at two international conferences has provided opportunities to discuss her research topic with specialists in the field, such as Bridget Heal, Andrew Spicer, Jonathan Willis, Alex Walsham and Virginia Reinburg.

Abandoning the idea of the conference has also led to the postponement of the project to publish in synthetic manner the results of research from 2011 to 2016. We considered that it would be useful to deploy the financial resources of the project to publish a monograph written by Ciprian Firea as a result of his research undertaken within the project entitled *Polipticele medievale din Transilvania: artă, liturghie, patronaj*. We think that in the future the specific results of research undertaken by all the members of the team may find a place in the first issue for 2017 of the journal *Studia Universitatis Babeş-Bolyai Historia*, a journal included in international databases, published by the university which has hosted this project.

The maintenance of the project website so that it would reflect the dynamics of research has been a permanent activity in 2016 as well. The information published on the website refers, as usual to the research visits to various institutions and attendance of national and international conferences as well as to the publications of the members of the research team.

The second objective of the project has been the evaluation of the project's impact. This was to be achieved first of all by devising a questionnaire, which was to assess the impact of the project at academic level. This questionnaire was to be distributed to the conference participants and thus the annulment of the event has had a negative impact on the collection of data. It is possible that the publication of the questionnaire on the website would eventually render some positive responses and allow a long-term assessment of the impact of research results. Hopefully the academic community will be interested in the results of research concerning norms and their transgression in medieval and early modern Transylvania.

On the other hand, this objective has been achieved through the consolidation of the team as a research group, obvious especially during field research. Between 30 August and 1 September 2016 Maria Crăciun and Ciprian Firea have undertaken field research in the villages of Beia, Boarta, Brădeni, Bunești, Buzd, Cloașterf, Daia, Homorod, Mediaș, Rupea, Ruși, Saschiz, Seleuș, Sibiu.

Finally, several members of the team have been involved in international research projects. For example, Mária Lupescu-Makó and Carmen Florea have continued to cooperate with the MARGEC (Marginalité, économie, société: la vie matérielle des couvents mendicants en Europe Centrale) project, financed by the Agence Nationale de la Recherche (France), a research project started in 2011 under the direction of Professor Marie-Madeleine de Cevins (University of Rennes), which has brought together scholars from France, the Czech Republic, Poland, Hungary and Romania. Attendance of conferences has also provided team members with opportunities to establish contacts with scholars interested by similar topics and to become familiar with the development of research within their field of interests.

Moreover, the members of the team have established contacts and cooperation with scholars from Romania and abroad. For example, Ovidiu Ghitta has benefited from a research visit to Rome between 1-11 July 2016. In this context he has undertaken research at the Archivio Storico "De Propaganda Fide". The funds investigated were: Acta Sacrae Congregationis (vo. 143); Scritture Originali Riferite nelle Congregazioni Generali (vol. 839, 844, 845, 847, 848) and Scritture Riferite nei Congressi (section 33 - vol. 2; section 51 - vol. 11, 12, 13, 14, 16, 18; section 61 - vol. 6, 7). The issues under scrutiny were the investigation initiated by the secular and ecclesiastical authorities regarding the icon that had wept at Blaj in 1764; the governing of the bishopric of Muncaci during the time of bishop Andrei Bacinschi, the scholar being focused on the attempts of the Uniate hierarch to discipline the individual and social behaviour of the clergy and faithful. For both research directions Ovidiu Ghitta has managed to identify previously unedited documents and thus to gather new

information, which will be used in the analysis and texts he intends to publish in the near future. Beyond the benefit of this research, which will undoubtedly enhance the impact of the project, the research visit has provided an opportunity to meet scholars in the field, for example professor Francesco Guida from the University Roma 3.

Maria Crăciun has benefited from a research visit to Berlin between 25 July and 23 August 2016, where the Staatsbibliothek has allowed her to become familiar with recent literature essential to the finalising of her research project concerning the art present in Transylvanian Lutheran churches. A brief research visit to London between 17-20 September 2016 has allowed her to consult the photographic collection of the Warburg Institute of London University. The environment of the Warburg Institute has provided the opportunity to meet and discuss mutual research interests with Andrea Gatti who has started an exploration of the production of Lutheran retables by the Cranach workshop.

Finally one has to note that 2016 has been the end of the road for this project because six years of research have come to an end. The results of the project are important as the works published during this time and especially during the last year of the project show that the research methods developed and tested throughout the project have reached their maturity and proven their efficacy. The moment also represents a beginning, as it is obvious that the relation between norms and transgressions is far from fully investigated and will thus offer substance for future research.